



Zoning Committee

REQUEST

Current Zoning: N1-B (Neighborhood 1-B)
Proposed Zoning: N1-E(CD) (Neighborhood 1-E, Conditional)

LOCATION

Approximately 7.89 acres located south of Valeview Lane, north of Trailer Drive, and west of Dalecrest Drive.
(Council District 1 - Anderson)

PETITIONER

Carolina Properties III, LLC

**ZONING COMMITTEE
ACTION/ STATEMENT
OF CONSISTENCY**

The Zoning Committee voted 4-2 to recommend APPROVAL of this petition and adopt the consistency statement as follows:

To Deny:

The petition is **inconsistent** with the goals and policies of the *North Middle Community Area Plan* based on the information from the staff analysis and the public hearing, and because:

- The petition may not facilitate priority goals of the area plan.
- Although the petition is in alignment with the *2040 Policy Map* recommendation for the Neighborhood 1 Place Type, it does not meet the Creating Complete Communities Place Type 5 Criteria for a change to a more intense Neighborhood 1 zoning classification.

Therefore, we find this petition to not be reasonable and not in the public interest, based on the information from the staff analysis and the public hearing, and because:

- The proposed rezoning is inconsistent with the goals and policies of the recently adopted *North Middle & Outer Community Area Plan (CAP)* as the plan does not align with Place Type 5 (PT-5).
- The PT-5 criteria establish standards to ensure that new development is compatible with surrounding residential patterns by evaluating factors such as lot size and configuration, street frontage types, and the location of the parcel within the block (e.g., mid-block or corner), with the goal of maintaining cohesive neighborhood character.
- The proposed rezoning does not fully align with the PT-5 criteria, as the lot widths and dimensions are substantially smaller than those within the adjacent neighborhood. However, the site is accessed from an

- existing street stub, the proposed streets match the local residential street classifications in the area, and the parcel is neither a corner nor mid-block lot.
- Site specific design, open space, and landscaping elements should be included to minimize potential exposure to undesirable or unhealthy conditions when introducing new single family development adjacent to existing industrial development or Manufacturing & Logistics Place Type.
 - The petition should consider utilizing a larger portion of the land area available to increase lot sizes and bring lots more inline with the dimensional standards of the adjacent neighborhood.
 - The site is in alignment with the *2040 Policy Map* designation of Neighborhood 1 Place Type.
 - The site is accessed by an existing street stub, installed with the intention of connecting to future development. The plan proposes low-intensity, single family detached dwellings along extended and new local residential public streets which matches the land use of the adjacent subdivision.
 - The site is not within walking distance of transit or Activity Center Place types thereby conforming to the low-intensity character of the established residential area.
 - The petition would not facilitate any additional *2040 Comprehensive Plan* Goals.

The approval of this petition will revise the recommended place type as specified by the *2040 Policy Map* for a portion of the site, from the Neighborhood 2 Place Type to the Neighborhood 1 Place Type for the site.

Motion/Second: Stuart / Shaw
 Yeas: Stuart, Shaw, Millen, and Welton
 Nays: Caprioli, McDonald
 Absent: Gaston
 Recused: None

ZONING COMMITTEE DISCUSSION

Staff provided a summary of the petition and noted that it is inconsistent with the *North Middle Community Area Plan*.

Commissioner McDonald asked about staff's comments regarding the proposed lot sizes in comparison to the adjacent neighborhood. Staff explained that Place Type-5 (PT-5) criteria is used to evaluate petitions proposing more intense zoning within Neighborhood 1 districts, such as a rezoning from N1-A to N1-C, and considers factors including the site's location on a block, street frontage, and the width and area of proposed lots.

Commissioner McDonald stated that she disagrees with any policy that would discourage single family housing adjacent to existing single family homes. She asked whether staff's primary objection to the rezoning is the lot size. Staff stated that they

also have concerns about the site's proximity to Manufacturing & Logistics (M&L) uses.

Commissioner McDonald then asked whether the creek running through the site provides separation from the adjacent M&L Place Type. Staff clarified that the creek separates the site from the multi-family development to the east, not from the M&L area to the south.

Commissioner McDonald noted that although the proposed development is relatively close to the adjacent M&L Place Type, many neighborhoods in the area also abut M&L, and she does not believe that should prevent single family development.

Commissioner Caprioli stated that it is encouraging to see a single family rezoning petition and felt that the open space amenities, such as the dog park, are a welcome addition. He expressed support for the rezoning request.

Commissioner Shaw stated that she agrees with staff's concerns. She noted that the petitioner has not appeared receptive to increasing lot sizes and stated that staff is attempting to balance site developability with the interests of neighboring homeowners and concerns regarding the adjacent M&L Place Type.

Commissioner McDonald stated that reducing the number of proposed dwellings would increase development costs, which could negatively impact affordability.

Commissioner Millen asked about the size of the M&L property to the south and whether approval of the rezoning would affect the permitted uses within the M&L Place Type. Staff stated that the I-2(CD) property is approximately 29 acres and is developed as a trucking facility. Staff also noted that the landscape yard on the I-2(CD) site is roughly 40 feet wide, which is less than what would be required under current standards.

Staff added that the PT-5 criteria were developed with community input to ensure new development aligns with the surrounding area's character.

Chairperson Welton stated that during the Community Area Planning process, many neighborhoods adjacent to M&L areas requested increased landscaping and screening standards. He expressed concern about the width of the buffer and the possibility of more noxious uses in the future.

Chairperson Welton then asked whether progress had been made with the petitioner in resolving the outstanding issues. Staff stated that the petitioner has made several concessions since the public hearing, including adding a privacy fence along the southern boundary, reducing the number of units from 27 to 24, reducing site acreage, and adding open space amenities. However, staff noted they do not have a clear understanding of how many additional units the petitioner could remove while maintaining project viability. Staff also noted that the site is very

narrow, so the N1-E district would still be needed for setback compliance.

Commissioner Caprioli moved to recommend approval of the petition. Commissioner McDonald seconded the motion. The motion failed with a vote of 4-2.

There was no further discussion of this petition.

MINORITY OPINION

Commissioner Caprioli stated that the proposed rezoning aligns with the intent of the adopted plans and policies by adding additional single family homes to an existing neighborhood and providing open space amenities that exceed UDO requirements. He also noted that while the site is adjacent to a Manufacturing & Logistics Place Type, any potential resident would be aware of that proximity from the outset.

PLANNER

Maxx Oliver 704-336-3571